

## TECHNICAL WORKING GROUP (TWG) MEETING # 3 SUMMARY

**Date:** January 18, 2018  
**Time:** 10:00 AM - 1:00 PM  
**Location:** Payson Senior Center, 514  
West Main Street, Payson, AZ  
85541

### Meeting Summary

#### Introductions

- Travis Ashbaugh, CAG Transportation Planning Manager, welcomed study participants and asked them to introduce themselves (Sign-in sheet attached). He then read the Title VI notice per CAG requirements.
- Vamshi Yellisetty reviewed the meeting agenda and mentioned that the purpose of the meeting was to review results from the draft Feasibility Report and discuss which of the recommendations should be carried forward to the next phase of the project – i.e., Implementation Plan.

#### Study Background/Purpose

Vamshi provided a brief study background and the purpose.

Study Background: CAG's 2015 Regional Transportation Plan identified the need to:

- Provide residents in Gila County with improved transit services.
- Connect rural areas in the CAG region to Maricopa and Pinal counties.

Study Purpose:

- Assess the current transit environment in the region.
- Identify the needs, travel alternatives, and unmet transit demand.
- Identify duplication or service overlaps; develop strategies to improve coordination among existing services.
- Conduct a Feasibility Study: Verify the need for transit service and assess community support.
- Develop an Implementation Plan, if needed.
- Identify and improve efficiencies by using existing transit resources.

Vamshi provided a brief update on the status of the project.

- Completed online Public Outreach Survey and summarized results.
- Completed draft Feasibility Report and provided to TWG members for review.

## Draft Feasibility Report Summary (PowerPoint attached)

Vamshi presented a summary of the draft Feasibility Report which included the following:

- Over 12 relevant studies were reviewed and summarized including the CAG and SCMPO Human Services Transportation Coordination Plan 2017-2019, 2004 Payson Area Transit Feasibility Study, 2011 San Carlos Apache Tribe Transit Feasibility Study, and 2011 Pinal County Transit Feasibility Study.
- Payson-Star Valley area has the highest population of 17,338 people. The focus area had a total population of 53,165.
- Payson-Star Valley had the highest percentage of elderly population (35%) and disabled population (23%); San Carlos Reservation had the highest percentage of minority population (99%), Female head of household (28%), and below poverty percentage (49%).
- Focus area has approximately 24,790 employees.
- Commute and travel behavior
  - About 2% of residents in San Carlos Apache Reservation use transit as a means of transportation for work related trips.
  - 67% of residents within the focus area have commute times less than 20 minutes.
  - 7AM to 8AM is the peak time residents in the focus area leave home for work.
  - 25% of residents in San Carlos Apache Tribe do not have access to a vehicle.
- Cobre Valley Community Transit (CVCT), San Carlos Nnee Bich'oo Nii Apache Transit (SCAT), White Mountain Apache Tribe, and Mountain Valley Shuttle are the only public transit providers.
- Approximately, 30 providers (public, private) currently offer transit services in the Study area.
- Outreach for the study was conducted via
  - Technical Working Group (TWG) meetings
  - Stakeholder/Transit Service Providers phone survey
  - Online public survey
- 50% of providers in the region were social service agencies and 19% were for-profit agencies.
- Unmet transit needs in the region included
  - CVCT
    - Lack of shelters and amenities at key stops.
    - Need to restructure fares, schedule, and fair break-points.
    - Remove less utilized stops and add more stops in Claypool and other locations.
  - SCAT
    - Need for a regional dispatch center.
  - Payson Senior Center
    - Service to Pine/Strawberry, Mesa de Caballo, Young.

- Service to transport medical patients seeking treatment.
- White Mountain Apache Tribe
  - Need for transportation division headquarters.
- 56% of surveyed providers had plans for expansion.
- Transit needs and demand analysis was conducted using the standard TCRP Report 161 methodology.
  - 14,833 people in the focus area and 3,198 people in Payson-Star Valley; likely need passenger service.
  - 361,680 likely person trips in the focus area and 121,680 person trips in Payson-Star Valley area.
- Transit Demand Model was developed based on the criteria - Where People Live, Where People Work, Where People Play, Where People Learn, and Where People Shop. Each criteria was given certain weight to develop a composite density map displaying areas of high potential transit usage and need. Payson-Star Valley, Globe-Miami, and San Carlos areas stood out as potential locations where there is need for transit.
- An online public survey was conducted. 408 surveys received. Vamshi emphasized that the survey results may not represent a complete picture of the needs of residents in the focus area and may be biased towards the types of population groups who responded to the survey. Survey summary included:
  - 217 of 408 responses received were from Payson-Star Valley area; 111 from Globe-Miami area and 32 from San Carlos Apache Reservation.
  - 28% respondents were 65 years or older; 75 percent of Payson-Star Valley area respondents are elderly; 36% of Globe-Miami respondents are under 18 years of age.
  - 54% respondents traveled less than 10 miles to work or school indicating that a majority of the trips are short trips.
  - More than 50% respondents drive themselves.
  - 29% respondents indicated that no public transportation services were available for their trips.
  - 59% respondents said transit service wasn't available on the times and days they needed to travel.
  - 76% said they would use public transportation if it were available.
  - 37% said they would use public transit several times a week.
  - 47% respondents said they prefer to drive than to use public transportation.
  - 56% respondents would use transit for shopping/errands; 40% for medical appointments, 42% for work or school trips.
  - 34% would pay \$1-\$2 for a ride within a community and 20% would pay \$5-\$6 for a ride between communities.
  - Frequent Origins/Destinations included:
    - Internally (within communities) – Payson-Star Valley area, Cobre Valley area.

- Between communities – Payson-Star Valley area to Phoenix; San Carlos Apache Reservation to Globe/Miami area; Globe/Miami area to Phoenix.

## Recommendations Summary

- Payson/Star Valley Area
  - Two deviated fixed service routes
  - Route 1 is a loop route of approximately 9.4 miles. Provides access to key activity centers in the Payson area.
  - Route 2 serves as a connection between Payson and Star Valley.
  - Deviations may be made to pick-up/drop-off persons meeting ADA and/or other criteria.
  - Continue private on-demand service.
- Globe/Miami Area
  - Expand the existing service route to include a larger portion of Miami
  - Evaluate and remove low ridership bus stops
  - Evaluate the current fare system
  - Current fare prices are low
  - Develop a new fare zone structure
  - Enforce reduced fare options
  - Install shelters with benches and with ADA access at least at key stops
  - Install proper signage at each stop
  - Develop a marketing and advertising plan
  - Establish strong online identity:
    - Create and maintain a dedicated website
    - Expand outreach using social media sites
    - Publish transit routes and schedules on Google Transit
  - Develop partnerships with local college, schools, big box stores, grocery stores, major employers, post office, and hospitals
  - Conduct outreach using traditional local media (newspapers and radio) and at community events
  - Collaborate with other transit providers.
- San Carlos Apache Transit
  - Establish a regional dispatch center.
  - Publish transit routes and schedules on Google Transit.
  - Partner with and coordinate service schedules and transfer locations with other transit providers.
  - Evaluate the feasibility of a seasonal connection to White Mountain Apache Tribe

communities.

- Assess the need and feasibility of a deviated fixed-route connection from Oro Valley to the Apache Sky Casino.
- Explore the need and feasibility of a deviated fixed-route connection to the Payson-Star Valley area.
- Countywide/Regional: Develop a regional system. Two options –
  - Option 1: Establish a CAG region-wide public transit agency. CAG or a similar agency would manage and operate transit services as one entity.
  - Option 2: Establish a central contact (agency or person) to coordinate all transit services (public and private) in Gila County. Each individual provider/operator will operate independently but will closely coordinate services and operations with the central contact.

## Discussion: Recommendations to Carry Forward to Implementation Plan

- Eddie Caine facilitated the discussion about which, if any, of the recommendations should be carried forward to Phase II - Implementation Plan.
  - Payson-Star Valley area:
    - TWG members agreed that the study clearly indicates the need for public transit in Payson-Star Valley area.
    - Curtis Ward, Town of Payson Engineer, suggested that dial-a-ride may be more successful in the Payson area than fixed route service.
    - Sarah Allred, ADOT 5311 Program Manager, cited that the Payson-Star Valley area has very similar characteristics of Show Low which operates a very successful deviated fixed route service.
    - Several TWG members commented that the implementation study is needed in order to get detailed cost estimates to run a transit system. The decision whether a transit system should be implemented must be made after the Implementation Plan results.
    - TWG members recommended carrying forward these recommendations to the Implementation Plan.
  - Cobre Valley Community Transit:
    - TWG members agreed that the Feasibility Study recommendations should be carried forward to the next phase.
  - Countywide/Regional:
    - After extensive deliberations, TWG members preferred “Option 2: Establish a central contact (agency or person) to coordinate all transit services (public and private) in Gila County” to streamline transit operations in the region and could be evaluated further in the Implementation Plan.

## Next Steps and Action Items

- TWG members will have until February 9<sup>th</sup>, to review and provide comments on the draft Feasibility Report.

- Jacobs will proceed with developing the Implementation Plan.
- The draft Implementation Plan will be presented to City/Town Councils, CAG TTAC, Management committee, and Regional Council.

## Sign-in Sheet





# Greater Gila County Transit Study Technical Working Group Meeting # 3

Date: 1/18/2018

Location: Payson Senior Center

Name	Agency	Address	Email	Phone	Initial
1 Andy Bernard	Fire Fighter - Tonto National Forest	Town of Young, AZ	<a href="mailto:Bernard1114@hotmail.com">Bernard1114@hotmail.com</a>	928-462-4969	
2 Audra Thomas	Maricopa Association of Governments	302 N. 1st Avenue, Phoenix	<a href="mailto:akthomas@azmag.gov">akthomas@azmag.gov</a>	602-254-6300	AFT
3 Bernadette Kniffin	San Carlos Apache Tribe	P.O. Box 871, Peridot	<a href="mailto:bkniffin@tanf.scot-nsn.gov">bkniffin@tanf.scot-nsn.gov</a>	928-475-5011	
4 Chancy Nutt	Town of Star Valley	3675 E Highway 260, Star Valley	<a href="mailto:cnutt@ci.star-valley.az.us">cnutt@ci.star-valley.az.us</a>	928-472-7752	Cell
5 Chris Bertone	Rim Country Chamber of Commerce	100 W Main St, Payson	<a href="mailto:chris@rimcountrychamber.com">chris@rimcountrychamber.com</a>	928-474-4515	
6 Curtis Ward	Town of Payson	303 N Beeline Highway, Payson	<a href="mailto:cward@paysonaz.gov">cward@paysonaz.gov</a>	928-472-5044	CWard
7 Eddie Caine	Central Arizona Governments (CAG)	1075 S Idaho Rd., Apache Jct	<a href="mailto:ecaine@cagaz.org">ecaine@cagaz.org</a>	480-474-9300	EC
8 Ellen Kretsch	Globe Miami Chamber of Commerce	1360 N Broad St, Globe	<a href="mailto:director@globemiamichamber.com">director@globemiamichamber.com</a>	928-425-4495	
9 Joanne Conlin	Payson Senior Center	514 W Main St, Payson	<a href="mailto:pseiorctr@gmail.com">pseiorctr@gmail.com</a>	928-474-4876	JC
10 Joseph Heatherly	Town of Miami	500 West Sullivan Street, Miami	<a href="mailto:Miamimanager@cableone.net">Miamimanager@cableone.net</a>	(928) 473-4403	
11 Mayor Bobby Smith	Town of Hayden	PO Box B, Hayden	<a href="mailto:bsmith@townofhayden.net">bsmith@townofhayden.net</a>	480-353-8653	
12 Paul Jepson	City of Globe	150 N Pine St, Globe	<a href="mailto:ptjepson@globeaz.gov">ptjepson@globeaz.gov</a>	928-425-7146x24	
13 Rev Chuck Proudfoot	Community Presbyterian Church	800 W Main St, Payson	<a href="mailto:cpcstudy@yahoo.com">cpcstudy@yahoo.com</a>	928-474-2059	cmp
14 Richard Cluster	Miami Transit - CVCT	506 W Sullivan ST, Miami	<a href="mailto:miamitransit@cableone.net">miamitransit@cableone.net</a>	928-473-8222	
15 Richard Powers	Jacobs Engineering	101 N 1st Avenue, Ste 2600, PHX	<a href="mailto:Rick.Powers@Jacobs.com">Rick.Powers@Jacobs.com</a>	(602) 530-1662	RP
16 Sara Allred	AZ Department of Transportation	206 S. 17th Ave., Phx	<a href="mailto:sallred@azdot.gov">sallred@azdot.gov</a>	602-712-4498	SA
17 Sylvia Kerlock	Town of Winkelman	PO Box 386, Winkelman	<a href="mailto:skerlock@townofwinkelman.com">skerlock@townofwinkelman.com</a>	520-356-7854	
18 Tara Chief	White Mountain Apache Tribe	PO Box 1710, Whiteriver	<a href="mailto:tarachief@wmat.us">tarachief@wmat.us</a>	928-338-5155	
19 Thomas Homan	Gila County Public Works	745 N. Rose Mofford Way	<a href="mailto:thoman@gilacountyaz.gov">thoman@gilacountyaz.gov</a>	928-402-8515	
20 Todd Pryor	Town of Superior	199 N Lobb Ave., Superior	<a href="mailto:manager@superioraz.gov">manager@superioraz.gov</a>	520-689-5752	
21 Travis Ashbaugh	Central Arizona Governments (CAG)	1075 S Idaho Rd., Apache Jct	<a href="mailto:tashbaugh@cagaz.org">tashbaugh@cagaz.org</a>	480-474-9300	✓
22 Vamshi Yellisetty	Jacobs Engineering	101 N 1st Avenue, Ste 2600, PHX	<a href="mailto:Vamshi.Yellisetty@jacobs.com">Vamshi.Yellisetty@jacobs.com</a>	(602) 530-1603	✓
23 Chris Simpson	CITY OF GLOBE		<a href="mailto:csimpson@globeaz.gov">csimpson@globeaz.gov</a>	602-686-1499	
24 Cathy Melvin	Gila County	1400 E. Ash	<a href="mailto:cmelvin@gilacountyaz.gov">cmelvin@gilacountyaz.gov</a>	928-402-4401	Cmel
23 Woody Cline	Gila County	1400 E. Ash	<a href="mailto:wcline@gilacountyaz.gov">wcline@gilacountyaz.gov</a>	"	WC
24 BEVER FREETMAN	TOWN OF PAYSON	303 N. BEELINE HWY.	<a href="mailto:BFREETMAN@PAYSONAZ.GOV">BFREETMAN@PAYSONAZ.GOV</a>	928-472-9034	DAF
23 Suzanne Kammerman	Payson Senior Center			474-4876	SK
24 Bessie Garcia	WMAT	P.O. Box 1710	<a href="mailto:casstakenton-garcia@wmat.us">casstakenton-garcia@wmat.us</a>	928-338-5155	CBG