



Transportation Technical Advisory Committee

October 13, 2022 Meeting Minutes

DATE: October 13, 2022
TIME: 10:00 a.m.
LOCATION: Via ZOOM Webinar

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Larry Halberstadt - *Chair*
(Payson)

Rick Powers
(Globe)

Tara Harman
(Pinal County)

Lana Clark
(Superior)

Barney Bigman
(San Carlos Apache Tribe)

Thomas Goodman
(Gila County)

Will Randolph
(ADOT - MPD)

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Tim Grier
(Star Valley)

Sandra Shade
(Ak-Chin Indian Community)

VACANT
(Hayden)

John Schempf
(Mammoth)

LaReesa Sanchez
(White Mountain Apache Tribe)

Sharon Jakubowski Wolz
(Kearny)

Sylvia Kerlock
(Winkelman)

Alexis Rivera
(Miami)

GUESTS PRESENT:

Duane Eitel
(Casa Grande)

Mark Henige
(ADOT LPA)

Jennifer Holbert
(ADOT LPA)

Chandra McMillan
(ADOT LPA)

CAG Staff:

Travis Ashbaugh
(Transportation Planning Director)

I. Call to Order

Chair Halberstadt called the meeting to order at 10:01 AM.

II. Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Halberstadt led the Committee in the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. Roll Call

Roll call was taken. Seven (7) voting members were present, constituting a quorum as established by the CAG TTAC Bylaws.

IV. Introductions & Title VI Notice

Introductions were made individually on the Webinar. Mr. Ashbaugh, at this time, read a statement of where and how to file a complaint regarding Title VI violations.

V. **Approval Of Minutes – (August 11, 2022)**

Mr. Powers made the motion to approve the August 11, 2022 minutes as presented. Ms. Clark seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

VI. **Call to the Public**

No one answered the call to the public.

VII. **Standing Reports**

A. **Member Jurisdictions**

Payson

Chair Halberstadt reported on one (1) item:

1. The Right-of-Way and easement acquisition is now underway for the “**Granite Dells Road**” project (**Project # PAY 19-01D**). It is expected to be wrapped up by April 2023. A revised workbook and schedule was sent to ADOT LPA

No other agencies present had updates.

B. **Multi-Modal Planning Division, ADOT**

Mr. Randolph reported on five (5) items:

1. **FY24-28 Planning to Programming Cycle:** Virtual workshops have concluded with all the engineering districts as of September 13, 2022. The P2P list will be finalized this month with consideration of fiscal constraints and recommending projects for scoping, to drafting the five-year construction program in the later part of this year into early next year.
2. **HSIP Call-for-Projects for FY25-26 Program:** The final applications that were submitted to ADOT TSS have been adjusted. ADOT has returned comments back to those agencies, who will have 30 days upon receipt of the comments, to return their revised application. LPA is still holding to the schedule to present proposed eligible applications to TSMO later this month and depending on approval will have a virtual meeting with the Safety Committee at the end of October or early November. Eligibility letters will potentially be sent by the end of the year and provided to MPD for the five-year construction plan in January 2023.
3. **Long Range Transportation Plan:** the consultant is currently working on deliverables, with continued internal meetings in the department regarding the plan. The public survey will be sent out in October/November 2022. Presentations regarding the LRTP will be provided to TACs in November 2022. Public participation meetings (in person and Statewide virtual) will be scheduled for early next year (February/March 2023).
4. **Statewide Rest Area Study:** Data collection efforts are complete, and work will continue with the plan deliverables. Tribal outreach has also been conducted, and meetings are scheduled for the end of the month to coincide with the deliverables. The Study team is also coordinating efforts and priorities with the freight program.
5. **Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Plan:** The EV Plan was submitted to the US Joint Energy Office and Transportation on August 1, 2022. ADOT was notified that they had one of the best plans in the nation. ADOT will be moving forward with performing updates to the plan for finalization in November 2022 and will continue to meet with stakeholders, vendors, and have further public involvement meetings. For

more information, visit ADOT's EV Plan website, sign up to the mailing list to receive study updates by email and opportunities to provide input on the Plan:

<http://azdot.gov/planning/transportation-studies/arizona-electric-vehicle-program>

C. Local Public Agency, ADOT

Mr. Henige reported on three (3) items:

1. Mr. Henige expressed his appreciation for the Arizona Rural Transportation Summit and the Arizona Roads and Streets Conference. He stated it was nice to see other stakeholders and local agency representatives. He stated there was a lot discussed on the IIJA during the two assemblies, more specifically on the Off-System Bridge program and the SMART funding. He stated with the SMART funding, there has been some confusion on how that program will be implemented and is waiting for the issues that have been brought up to be resolved. Ms. Holbert also added for clarification that there are two (2) SMART programs. One is under the IIJA legislation and the other is within the AZ SMART program, in which Mr. Henige was discussing.
2. The "Every-Day Counts" quarterly meetings is expected to begin meeting again after a six month hiatus. One of the goals is to have discussion on successes and challenge on local projects so that all can learn from one another.
3. An "Emergency Relief" fund program presentation is expected to be schedule with the TACs across the state. He stated there have been recent "lessons learned" and would like to share that with the group for a future meeting.

D. District, Engineers, ADOT

Mr. Minefee reported on seven (7) items:

1. There is an Emergency Relief project (Project # F0440) for fence replacement due to the Mescal/Telegraph fires, on SR-77, SR-177, and US-60.
2. The "**Tonto Creek Bridge**" project kicked off.
3. There is a US-60 pavement life extension project that will begin October 14, 2022 around mile marker 208, running to the Town of Superior.
4. The US-60 Lighting project from Radanovich Boulevard to Cherry Avenue is underway. This is an HSIP funded project.
5. The "**Sand Tanks Wash**" bridge will soon be undergoing a scour retrofit and overlay, with a guardrail update, off of US-60 around mile marker 208.
6. The "**Pinal County Queen Creek**" bridge replacement project will begin soon.
7. An Emergency Relief project regarding the US-60 embankment repairs due to flooding (mile post 241-245 +/-) will begin soon.

Mr. Powers commented that ADOT might want to look at a section on the US-60 near the O'Reilly auto part store in Globe as there has been two fatalities within the last week. Mr. Minefee stated it is on the radar.

E. CAG Transportation Planning Update

Mr. Ashbaugh reported on two (2) items:

1. A great big thank you was given to all those who attended the Arizona Rural Transportation Summit. There was a lot of great feedback that was given to CAG and the Sun Corridor MPO for hosting the Summit, and many had stated it was the best one attended in many years. Officially, there were 15 State Legislators in attendance that represented a golden opportunity to discuss the RTAC Priority Project list with them.
2. CAG is working with federal agencies to formulate a remediation plan due to the ransomware received on our main server. Access to historical files is very limited at this point, however many files have been accessed from emails or paper copies in order to continue with the day-to-day business until the issue is resolved.

VIII. Old Business

A. Transportation Improvement Program Amendments(s)

No updated TIP amendments were brought forward. No action was taken.

IX. New Business

A. CAG FY23-FY27 Traffic Count Program: Recommendation

Mr. Ashbaugh stated that only two proposals were received. One from All Traffic Data Services and the other from United Civil Group. He reviewed the rankings stating that United Civil Group received the higher ranking of the two by a large margin from many viewpoints. Mr. Ashbaugh expressed his concern with regards to the cost. He stated that the Request for Proposal (RFP) stated there was approximately \$80,000 available, with possible wiggle room for additional funding if justification was provided within the proposal. He stated that although United Civil Group clearly had a better written proposal, they were asking for over \$134,000 to conduct the traffic counts over the five-year period.

Mr. Ashbaugh stated that only have \$100,000 has been budgeted within the TIP to conduct traffic counts and some of those funds are needed to administer and for the time it takes to review and upload the data to the MS2 software. He speculates the reason for United Civil Group's high bid is that it appears within their proposal that they believe they would be uploading the data to MS2 and therefore factored in that time to do so. However, it is uncertain what the reason would be until there is the opportunity to speak with them, pending the recommended decision here.

There was a consensus that United Civil Group did prepare a much better proposal in comparison to All Traffic Data in all categories with the exception of cost. The discussion whether or not if the DBE designation is a factor in this decisions since the DBE goal is 0.0 percent. Mr. Ashbaugh stated that even if you take away the 10 points that would be given if the consultant is a DBE, United Civil Group would still have a large margin. He restated that costs is the primary factor right now and the only two options he sees at the moment is to negotiation United Civil Group down towards \$80,000 or to find the money within the TIP by reducing other projects to make it work.

After further discussion on the importance of comparing the costs of both proposals, and the time commitment it could take to successfully negotiation and get a contract signed before the first set of counts, the consensus shifted towards All Traffic Data being the more responsible proposal. The Committee believes both consultants can do the work successfully, but the ultimate reasoning came down to costs.



Ms. Harman made the motion to recommended to award All Traffic Data Services to conduct the CAG FY23-FY27 Traffic Count Data Collection Services Program, for reasons due to costs as proposed. Mr. Goodman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. Off-System Bridge (OSB) & Bridge Formula Program Presentation

Mr. Henige presented a PowerPoint presentation regarding the two programs. The presentation is available upon request. He stated that the purpose of the presentation is to assist and provide guidance of the ADOT process and implementation in accessing the federal funding for both programs. The presentation discussed available funding amounts, eligibility determination, criteria for eligibility, types of applications, the project selection process, and the application timeline.

The two distinctive differences in the two programs involve how much is available per program and the cap amount per project in each program. The Off-System Bridge program has \$3.9 million available with a cap amount at \$1 million per project. The Bridge Formula program has \$6.7 million available with no cap amount per project. However, when applying, one must determine which program they are seeking.

The Call-for-Projects occurred on October 3, 2022 and applications are due to ADOT LPA Section, via CAG, by December 30, 2022. Mr. Ashbaugh asked the Committee who was planning on applying during this Call-for-Projects. Globe and San Carlos stated that they are expecting to apply. Mr. Ashbaugh stated that CAG TTAC would then be required to prioritize the projects before sending to ADOT LPA Section. Therefore, all applications will need to be submitted to CAG by December 1, 2022 so that they can be packaged with the December 2022 TTAC meeting materials. Notification of selections will be made sometime in February 2023.

Ms. Holbert stated that the presentation given and all the information stated here should be posted on the ADOT website within a week.

C. Round Table

No discussion took place.

D. Future Agenda Items

Mr. Ashbaugh stated that there have been a few vendors from the Roads and Streets Conference, with regards to their products, that he would like to have present during a TTAC meeting. One of the vendors involves solar street lighting products that claim to save around 50 percent installation and maintenance costs, and the other involving base material that should allow for the roadway segment to last much longer than the traditional methods. Mr. Ashbaugh stated that since we are constantly trying to find ways to stretch out our dollars for transportation projects, he saw this opportunity to get these items before the Committee to consider for future projects.

Mr. Henige asked when ADOT can present the Emergency Relief Program. After discussion, the consensus was to have this presentation at the December 15, 2022 meeting.

X. Scheduling of Next Meetings

The next tentatively scheduled meetings are for November 17, 2022 and December 15, 2022.

XI. Adjournment

Chair Halberstadt adjourned the meeting at 11:30 AM.